
A Comparative Study of Teacher's Empowerment Systems Based on in-Service Trainings

Abolhassan Bazi¹, Sayed Kamal Vaezi^{2*}, Ali Asghar Pourezat³, Tayebah Abbasi⁴

1. PhD Student in Management, Public Sector Policy Orientation, Kish Campus Faculty, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran.
 2. Associate Professor of Public Management, Department of Public Management, Faculty of Management, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran.
 3. Professor, Faculty of Management, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran.
 4. Assistant Professor, Faculty of Management, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran.
-

Article history:

Received date: 2020/08/22

Review date: 2020/10/25

Accepted date: 2020/10/31

Keywords:

Teacher's Empowerment, In-service Training, Comparative study, Teachers, Study

Abstract

Purpose: The purpose of this study was to compare teachers' empowerment systems based on in-service trainings.

Methodology: The present study was practical in terms of purpose and qualitative research in terms of data collection using a four-stage approach introduced by George. Z. Brady and John Stuart Mill's method of agreement. The statistical population included countries (Canada, South Korea, Japan, Finland, and Australia, due to the absence of African countries in the ranking, Malaysia due to its close cultural and political context) according to the ranking in Legatum Success Index (2019) and the characteristics of pre-service and in-service teacher training (Arthur Donald Chaker and Richard Hines, 1997) that was selected based on purposive sampling. The information needed to answer the questions of this research has been collected through library documents, research reports, encyclopedias and university statutes, and site searches.

Findings: Research findings show that teacher's professional development should be considered as a process system and their professional development should be systematically designed, supported, budgeted and reviewed. This system should promote and make teachers effective.

Conclusion: Each country's principals and officials considering regional requirements along with upstream documents implement different measures and programs to improve the quality of teacher's empowerment programs.

Please cite this article as: Bazi A, Vaezi S K, Pourezat A A, Abbasi T. (2020). A Comparative Study of Teacher's Empowerment Systems Based on in-Service Trainings. *Iranian Journal of Educational Sociology*. 3(4): 140-149.

* Corresponding author: vaezi_ka@ut.ac.ir

1. Introduction

By changing the thinking system of managers and employees towards the organization and increasing their job capabilities, Staff training can have a major role in performance as one of the main methods of human resource improvement (Moradi, et al, 2019). Since human resources are the most important factor and axis in organizations, equipping and preparing human resources to face change is of great importance. All organizations with any mission they have must dedicate the most capital, time and the program to human development in different dimensions (Haqhvari, et al, 2020). In Iran, despite the long history of formal education, the increase in registration rate and all the progress that has taken place in recent decades in this field, education has not kept pace with the world level. This is one of the main reasons for the low quality of education, especially in primary school. This fact is acknowledged by the agents of this field and also can be distinguished by referring to the results of international evaluations of the educational systems of different countries (Askari, et al, 2019) According to the "Legatum Success Index" published in 2019, Iran is ranked 71st among 149 countries in 2019, 71st in 2018 and 66th in 2017 in terms of educational quality (Legatum, 2019), Because in-service training provides timely and up-to-date knowledge and job and professional skills for teachers. Organization requires new thinking, new models and new approaches to provide in-service trainings .Therefore, in the new world in-service training is the most effective way to adapt employees to the changing conditions of time. In order to provide useful and effective education for learners, the teacher must gain experiences from the real environment during the training so that he can act the best in professional and educational situations with awareness and study with the challenges he faces (Raeisi, 2017).

As a human resource, the teacher is one of the basic factors of education in any country and the change in education systems is meaningful in relation to him and how to provide and train teachers .As mentioned, effectiveness of the educational system educational policy and teacher empowerment are the most important factor to make effective educational system. Teachers have an important role to play in developing an inclusive education system. Therefore, mastery of subject knowledge, good communication skills, professional commitment, dedication and motivation are the necessary traits of teachers. To achieve such qualities, it is necessary to provide quality training to teachers. Teachers qualitative training relates to the framework of policies, procedures and rules designed to provide the knowledge, attitude, behavior, and skills of futuristic teachers so that they can perform their duties effectively in school and Community (Singh, Shakir, 2019). Rapid technological advances in the contemporary world indicate that teachers' knowledge and skills are obsolete in a short period of time. This issue requires continuous improvement of modern trends and knowledge (Jackson, et al, 2019). So that investing in teacher education is one of the most profitable ones, because capable teachers are the starting point of any educational transformation. In different countries of the world, the task of teacher training is assigned to independent or affiliated academic units of that country. But it is important to note that in some countries of the world, new policies have been designed for teacher training that lead to change of a country from the state of poverty and backwardness towards an advanced country (Azazi, et al, 2015). Entering the new era and the need to coordinate educational systems with future developments has caused the countries of the world to make changes in their teacher training programs and eliminate the existing shortcomings .In-service training is one of the most important ones of the organization, because job needs and environmental conditions in the organization are constantly exposed to various changes (Vaezi and Razaaghi, 2015). In-service training can be considered as " Systematic effort to harmonize the aspirations and interests and future needs of individuals with the future needs of the organization, in the form of what is expected of individuals " (Pierrogater, 1983, quoted in Fathi and Ejargah, 2017). Singh, Shakir (2019) were of the opinion that most teachers who participate in the internship training course do not effectively to understand students' mistakes, strengthen teachers' knowledge, prepare textbooks and interpret the curriculum in relation to teaching.

Education is also defined in the theoretical foundations of fundamental transformation document as follows: "The interactive process paves the way for the continuous development and excellence of the identity of educators, in an integrated manner and based on the standard Islamic system, in order to guide them on the path of preparation for the conscious and voluntary realization of the life of Tayyibeh in all dimensions "(Samieinejad, et al, 2016). In a comparison between in-service courses in Iran and Germany showed that in-service programs for Iranian teachers do not meet their educational needs. Therefore, teachers' in-service programs should be designed differently based on measuring the different needs of different age groups of teachers, and in designing in-service training programs, the principle of decentralization should be observed in order to be more flexible and meet regional and local needs. These programs should be designed and implemented at the same time in all levels of education to maintain the necessary coordination between different levels of education. While in-service training programs in Germany include topics related to new teaching methods, familiarity with new textbooks in various fields of science, classroom management, knowledge of advanced teaching theories, gaining skills in the use of tools and Modern education equipment including computers and the Internet (Sharafi, et al, 2016).

The results of Omrani, et al (2017) show that: 1) In all three countries of Iran, Japan and the United Kingdom for the selection of student teachers, special conditions and competency criteria are considered, which indicates the importance of accepting and selecting candidates for the teaching profession, Due to the fact that in Japan and the United Kingdom, the teaching profession has a worthy status and social status. 2) In all three countries, improving the quality of teacher education at the national level has been mentioned as the overall goal of teacher education and has focused on teacher education programs, with the difference that in the United Kingdom they have established standardization institutes in this field. In Iran and Japan, goals have been set in the form of general competencies and capabilities. 3) Most training programs to improve the professional competencies of teachers in all three countries are offered in the form of in-service training programs. There is a significant difference in the nature and how to improve the professional competencies of teachers in both Japan and the United Kingdom with Iran, which can be, for example, by setting standards and marking the quality of teachers in the United Kingdom, the widespread use of educational technology in in-service teaching Pointed out in Japan .Findings of Yazdanifar (2017) showed that in terms of length of training, the teacher training system in Iran is 4 years and in Finland is 5 years. Internships are also held in Finland in pilot schools and in Iran in regular schools. In addition, the number of courses in teacher training in Finland is 300 and in Iran is 150. Also, teacher training courses in Finland are held by 8 major universities in this country, while in Iran, the newly established Farhangian University is responsible for manpower development .Accordingly, it is obvious that different societies in terms of technical knowledge, infrastructure, tendencies and cultures require using different and appropriate methods to achieve effective teachers in the educational system of each country. Achieving the appropriate methods requires doing scientific research, in other words, dealing wisely with this phenomenon. Considering that the selected countries in teacher education have one of the largest teacher education systems in the world, the present study has done to comparatively study the curriculum elements of their teacher training centers and compare it with Iran and provide practical suggestions to improve the situation of Iranian teacher training centers and seeks to answer the following questions: What are the indicators of teacher empowerment through in-service training in the studied countries? What are the indicators of lifelong and continuous learning of teachers in the studied countries? What are the indicators of teachers' professional knowledge production in the studied countries? What are the similarities and differences in empowerment through in-service training in the countries studied?

2. Methodology

The present study was practical in terms of purpose and qualitative research in terms of data collection using a four-stage approach introduced by George. Z. Brady and John Stuart Mill's method of agreement. The statistical population included countries (Canada, South Korea, Japan, Finland, and Australia, due to the absence of African countries in the ranking, Malaysia due to its close cultural and political context) according to the ranking in Legatum Success Index (2019) and the characteristics of pre-service and in-service teacher training (Arthur and Richard, 1997) that was selected based on purposive sampling. The information needed to answer the questions of this research has been collected through library documents, research reports, encyclopedias and university statutes, and site searches. This method consists of four stages (Flick, 2013): a) Descriptive stage: In this stage, to prepare sufficient findings and take notes of the phenomena based on evidence and information from various sources and study and documents and reports of others. B) Interpretation stage: This stage includes the review of information that the researcher has described in the first stage. C) Adjacent stage: During this stage, the information that has been interpreted by the method of sociological study, is classified and placed next to each other to show their similarities and differences and prepare for the next stage. In this stage, the researcher believes that the researcher can achieve your research hypothesis. D) Comparison stage: The differences and similarities of the studied phenomena are compared. Method of collecting information and data: 1- Studying the documents available in libraries 2- Checking various internet sites and receiving information from them 3- Using graduate thesis and other researches done 4- Using the articles in Available magazines. The information obtained from referring to library documents and websites indicates that some countries in the world in the field of teacher training programs have had a more successful performance compared to other countries. For instance, Arthur Donald Chaker and Richard Hines, two researchers and educators in their study entitled (Schools of the World, New Standards of Education), study the characteristics of the world's top systems, and the reasons for their superiority.

The purpose of this study was to present a single set of the world's top education standards and compare it with the US education system. The first step was to prepare a list that could be compared to the United States, so 10 countries were selected in the final selection process. They had similar characteristics in 35 categories, each of which accounted for a share of the world education system. Standards were set based on the inputs and outputs of schools in selected countries. Some of the approved criteria were: tuition fees, classes, teachers (pre-service and in-service teacher training features) and.... (Arthur and Richard, 1997; Cited by Mollainejad, 2008, 2014 and Rezaei and Nadi, 2017) These studies also show that these countries are leaders in the field of teacher training. The ranking of the top ten countries is as follows: South Korea ranks first, Japan second, then Singapore third, Hong Kong fourth, but Finland fifth after last years, Britain ranked sixth, followed by Canada at seventh, followed by the Netherlands at eighth, Ireland at ninth, and Poland at tenth. Countries (from the Americas (Canada), from Eurasia (South Korea and Japan), from Europe (Finland) and due to the absence of African countries in the ranking, Malaysia due to its close cultural and political context) According to the rankings in Legatum Success Index (2019) and based on the characteristics of pre-service and in-service teacher training, etc. (Arthur and Richard, 1997) have been selected as a sample.

3. Findings

Question 1: What are the indicators of teacher empowerment through in-service training in the studied countries?

Table1. The indicators of empowerment

Country	The indicators of empowerment
South K	Collaboration, review of educational content by teachers, joint observation and public participation, development of teacher training standards, partnership of teacher training centers and university centers with the country's schools, cognitive and skill competencies, attitudinal and behavioral competencies, managerial competencies.
Canada	Institutionalization and formation of multiple think tanks in an evolutionary and gradual process, the existence of teachers' unions and trust in teachers by the government, extensive participation in teacher training, facilities and facilities available to teachers for professional development.
Malay	The development of professional competence includes self-development, keeping up with any new knowledge and research, and reflecting on how the teaching experience should be considered and taught in practice. Education enhances thoughtful thinking, helping instructors to evaluate the teaching process. In addition, it facilitates the development and improvement of self-reflective thinking about professional competence, which in turn increases the quality of teaching in the future.
Iran	In the documents studied in Iran, special competencies in the field of professional identity of coaches (specialized knowledge and knowledge and training skills) have been mentioned, which through the provision of various opportunities, the possibility of selecting, prioritizing and applying what has been learned in The field of action is provided in accordance with individual talents and abilities and the type of professional responsibility: 1- Competencies focused on subject knowledge (specialized competence of the field): Aware of the knowledge of capable disciplines in research in that field. Here, mastery of thematic knowledge (scientific achievements) and ability to apply methodological knowledge (scientific methods) are considered2- Competencies focused on educational knowledge: Familiar with educational knowledge and capable of planning and implementing the curriculum. In other words, the application of educational knowledge in different educational situations has been considered. 3- Competencies focused on thematic educational practice: Able to teach in the field. This competence is the result of intertwining and combined perception and application of subject knowledge and educational knowledge in educational situations. 3- Competences focused on general knowledge: This competence emphasizes having religious literacy, language literacy (national), maintaining health and preserving the environment. Also of interest is the ability to analyze cultural and political phenomena and the ability to use international language.

Question 2: What are the indicators of lifelong and continuous learning of teachers in the studied countries?

Table2. The indicators of lifelong learning

Country	The indicators of lifelong learning
Japan	In the last two decades, many teacher training universities have been established that only deal with teacher training and research in various fields of education, and offer master's and higher courses (provide the necessary conditions for continuing education of employed teachers). One of the prerequisites for entering the teaching profession is having a teacher's certificate that is not specific to a specific course. State graduates receive a certificate that is valid for life and holders of master's and doctoral degrees to receive Special Certificate Any university or institution wishing to issue a teacher certification must have already obtained the necessary permission from the Ministry of Education, and if the applicants have not studied at authorized universities or colleges, the Ministry of Education provides them with a teacher's certificate by holding an exam, and primary and secondary school teachers receive a second-degree certificate by completing a two-year training course at a higher education institution (Rezaei et al., 2017).
South Korea	Assess the ability of the teacher training curriculum to create and promote the professional competence and competence of teachers and strengthen their job performance; Assess the level of preparation of selected teachers to grow and raise the level of teacher skills; Assessing the ability of the teacher training curriculum in creating and improving the knowledge and professional skills of teachers in the field of information and communication technology and its application in teaching and learning (Amraheh and Hakimzadeh, 2014).
Canada	Because teaching decentralization in Finland leads to local decision-making and consideration of local characteristics, it supports teachers' commitment to lifelong learning (Lavonen, 2017). Teachers are highly educated and have sufficient knowledge of the latest research on learning and education (Garbe, et al, 2016).
Malaysia	Attention to continuing professional learning has been emphasized in teacher training programs, and teachers are committed to effective action and student learning. This professional practice is manifested through experience, research, cooperation and knowledge. Teachers try to update their professional knowledge

(Ontario Teachers College, 2016). On the other hand, it has been said that continuous learning of teachers leads to the growth and development of their professions. Commitment to continuous learning is a central principle for teacher professionalism. Instructors' professional knowledge and efficiency are enhanced by engaging in professional learning, which is strongly related to student learning. Engaging in multiple learning opportunities improves teachers' professional practice (Vocational Learning Framework for the Teaching Profession, 2016) .

Iran In this case, planning for the growth and organization and excellence of ontological levels and the promotion of religious, moral, professional and professional competencies have been mentioned and the spontaneous promotion of the professional level of coaches is one of the competencies desired under the system. Teacher training and the provision of human resources (Theoretical foundations of fundamental change, 2011). The teacher has also been mentioned as a learner and educational researcher (National Curriculum, 2012) .

Question 3: What are the indicators of teachers' professional knowledge production in the studied countries?

Table3. The indicators of knowledge production

Country	The indicators of knowledge production
Japan	Extensive use of educational technology, information technology, internationalization of the education system, equipping the information system and using new tools and mass media, knowledge of how to apply subject knowledge in the real world, creativity and problem-solving skills (Mir Arefin et al., 2018).
South Korea	The Korea Foundation for the Advancement of Science and Creativity has organized an annual conference to facilitate practical or applied research (action research) through in-service teacher training and to promote the collaboration of the teacher research community (Joe et al., 2016). Since research action is one of the appropriate scientific solutions to classroom problems in the production of local knowledge, it can be consistent with this competency.
Canada	In the reviewed texts, the teacher is introduced as a researcher. From this perspective, teacher training programs emphasize research-oriented (Salberg, 2015). The combination of educational theories, research methodologies and practice play an important role in teacher education programs (Salberg, 2010). One of the characteristics that distinguish Finnish teachers from teachers in other countries is the conduct of teacher training research. They learn various research methods by participating in seminars and research projects and use them in educational studies. The creation of knowledge and critical and scientific thinking has been proposed as the main goal. Doing research is one of the most important competencies provided for teachers to achieve critical thinking, independent thinking, scientific literacy and questioning phenomena and knowledge (Niemi, 2015).
Malaysia	One of the essential competencies for the teacher is action research for teaching-learning activities (Mahdavi Hazaveh et al., 2016). From this perspective, the teacher's involvement with new knowledge and research and reflection on how the teaching experience is emphasized (Young et al., 2015) .
Iran	The researcher teacher has been mentioned based on his / her involvement in the prescribed or mandatory part of the curriculum in order to help improve the quality of teaching and learning (Theoretical Foundations of Fundamental Transformation, 2011). Being a learner and educational researcher is another feature that can be seen in documents and texts (National Curriculum, 2012).

Question 4: What are the similarities and differences between teacher empowerment through in-service training in different countries? All countries have mentioned improving the quality of teacher education as the overall goal of teacher education and have focused on teacher education programs. A comparative study of the teacher training curriculum system in different countries with the subject of quality of teachers is a combination of :Promoting education knowledge, thematic content knowledge Skills and attitudes necessary for effective teaching ,strong understanding of students' growth and development ,effective communication skills ,having moral commitments and the ability to learn for a life time .In these countries, the goals of teacher training have been formulated at the national level, and all countries under study are trying to increase communication programs and establish a balance between theoretical and practical education, establish communication between universities and university institutions, teacher training and confidence. Find out how to select students to attract the best volunteers to continue their education in teacher training to increase the quality of the student-teacher curriculum.

In-service training courses for Japanese teachers are a widespread use of educational technology, but the use of educational technology in Iran is at a very low level and is not comparable to Japan. In general, the results of the research show that in some areas, it is better to make reforms in the teacher education system in our country. In order to achieve the overall goal of improving the quality of teacher education, South Korea and Finland have established standardization institutes in this field, which are directly related to the teacher management centers in these countries. These institutions have developed the standards required for teacher training. The development of standards helps the student-teacher achieve the competencies and expectations developed, because these standards clearly define expectations and capabilities and help to evaluate effectively. But in three countries, Japan, Malaysia and Iran, goals have been set in the form of general competencies and capabilities. What distinguishes Iran in terms of how to evaluate the content of the teacher training program from the studied countries is the lack of attention to the evaluation of the teacher training curriculum in the field of curriculum content evaluation for diverse teachers in specialized fields of knowledge. What distinguishes our country in the field of evaluation of the teaching-learning process in the teacher training program from the studied countries, the lack of attention to the evaluation of the teacher training program in the field of program focus on evaluation of the training process related to professional skills Teachers in these courses are specialized in teaching-learning methods in the processes of production and application of knowledge.

4. Discussion

The purpose of this study was to compare teachers' empowerment systems based on in-service trainings. Research in Iran and other countries shows that each country has implemented different measures and programs to institutionalize the teacher-researcher approach. The Japanese government with targeted planning and offering different activities for teachers in the curriculum and in-service training of teachers such as teacher group participation and study in the form of action research in schools and the inclusion of the curriculum with an integrated approach in the textbooks and The provision of various incentive and welfare facilities has taken great strides in fostering the development of teacher-researcher knowledge, and the various welfare facilities provided have increased teacher motivation for research, and the Government of Canada has provided good opportunities for knowledge creation and research by Teachers have predicted. South Korea, by standardizing its teacher training and preparing a sinusoidal program for the professional development of teachers, and by providing abundant welfare and incentive facilities and high legal benefits, has acted in such a way that the first choice of excellent students is the job of teacher and train teachers, to consider research as a necessity in their profession. Features of the Finnish education system include the high position of teachers, the quality of teacher training centers, politicians' attention to the education system, attracting applicants with high ability, high education budget, political will, purposeful efforts to promote justice in the education system, teacher education He noted the high quality, professional and moral responsibility of teachers, the community's trust in educational actors, and the increase in teachers' education. Teacher authority and independence are high in Finland, which increases teachers' motivation and creativity. Unlike Finland, Turkey has a decentralized system. Malaysia and Iran have devised measures for their progress to solve their shortcomings and problems. Also, in terms of the World Thames test, Malaysia is higher than Iran, and Iran has made changes in its education system for its progress.

It is now being implemented and some of the methods that are hindering progress have been removed. In the Iranian education system, the selection of teachers has many shortcomings that are sometimes due to the position and position of teachers in society. One of the most important difficulties of the teacher training and selection system is the lack of attractiveness of teacher training centers and even teacher training universities for higher education candidates. The teacher does not have the necessary social status and in the current situation, the teacher is considered as an emergency job and a savior from unemployment

for young people. Teachers' salaries and welfare facilities are very limited and in no way comparable to other social occupations with the same education and experience. The salary and job benefits of a teacher are in some cases less than the welfare facilities and salaries of a simple worker. Teacher training courses have many educational and administrative difficulties. Intensive educational units with minimal educational facilities and equipment have received the necessary motivation to study and research more from teacher training centers, and on the other hand, the administration of the centers on a 24-hour basis with many limitations and meager welfare facilities, practically the spirit of generation teachers. It annoys the future, and in the future when it is accompanied by a lack of in-service training courses, inadequate salaries and a lack of attention to the social status of teachers and a lack of attention to their basic needs. It prevents them from properly performing the minimum educational duties they are responsible for. There is no effective and dynamic relationship between social, economic, industrial, cultural, and educational and research institutions and teacher training centers. This problem causes students to practically stay away from the existing realities and start doing their job with different attitudes and sometimes unreal and less effective in the sensitive status of a teacher.

The development of education and its efficiency more than ever requires the creation of the necessary attractions to attract the cooperation of the best talents as teachers. The importance of the teacher and paying attention to his position in the education system should be considered as a scientific duty and the necessary facilities should be used in all fields. As the most important factor in building the personality of future generations, it should be at the forefront of economic, social and cultural development programs, because any development depends on education and is one of the most important factors in teacher education. By examining various experiences of positive teacher participation in curricula, solutions should be provided that rely on raising teachers' awareness and knowledge because having knowledge and knowledge about the curriculum planning process is the most basic need of participants in decision making. Therefore, providing suitable grounds for continuous improvement of teachers' academic level through holding in-service training courses and workshops, creating motivation to improve the level of curriculum knowledge in them, the presence of school teachers in critique sessions and reviewing existing curricula, Reviewing the role of teachers and empowering them to assume duties and responsibilities can pave the way for teachers' participation in the curriculum planning process.

References

- Arthur D, Richard H. (1997), *Characterizing initial teacher education in Canada: Themes and issues*. Toronto, Canada: Ontario Institute for Studies in Education
- Askari M, Elahi M, Prizad R.(2019), *Comparison of Iran-Japan Educational Policy in Primary School*, *Strategic Studies of Public Policy (Strategic Studies of Globalization)*, 9(30): 113 - 132.
- Azazi M, Nourian M, Khosravi Babadi A, Norouzi D.(2015), *Synthesis Research in Comparative Studies of Teacher Education Systems in Iran and the World*, *Two Quarterly Journal of Theory and Practice in the Curriculum*, 6(11): 104-67.
- FathiVajargah K. (2017), *Staff In-Service Training Planning*, Tehran, University Humanities Books Study and Compilation Organization.
- Flick O. (2013), *An Introduction to Qualitative Research*, translated by Hadi Jalili, Tehran, Ney .
- Garbe C, Lafontaine D, Shiel G, Sulkunen S, et all. (2016). *Literacy in Finland: Country report. Children and adolescents*. European Literacy Policy Network (ELINET).
- Haqhvani M, Nouri A, MehryarKomijani A. (2020), *In-service training of educators: from effectiveness to efficiency*, *Quarterly Journal of New Approach in Educational Management*, 1(41): 305-324.
- Jackson N. (2019), *In-Service Teacher Training and Professional Development of Primary School Teachers in Uganda*, *IAFOR Journal of Education*, 7 (1).
- Joe H, Hong O, Song J. (2016). *An analysis of STEM/STEAM teacher education in Korea with a case study of two schools from a community of practice perspective*. *Eurasia Journal of Mathematics, Science & Technology*
- Lavonen J. (2017). *Governance ecentralization in education: Finnish innovation in education*. *Revista de Educación a Distancia*, 53, 1
- Legatum Institut. (2019). "The Legatum Prosperity Index". Available at:http://rosperitysite.s3-accelerate.amazonaws.com/3515/1187/1128/Legatum_Prosperty_Index_2019.pdf.
- Mahdavi H, Maliki H, Mehr Mohammadi M, Abbaspour A. (2016), *A Comparative Study of Competency-Based Curriculum System in Elementary Teacher Training Curriculum in Malaysia, India and Iran*, *Iranian Curriculum Studies Quarterly*, 11 (4): 23-64.
- Mir A, Mehr Mohammadi M, Ali Asgari M, Hossein nejad H.,(2018), *A Comparative Study of the Emphasis on the Use of Aesthetic Approach in Teaching in Pre-Service Teacher Training Programs*, *Quarterly Journal of Education*, vol 141.
- Mollainejad A. (2012), *Desirable professional competencies of primary school students*, *Educational Innovations*, 11(44): 33-62.
- Moradi A, Najafi A, Karami M. (2019), *the effect of in-service training on the performance of the staff of the NAJA Diplomatic Police Command*, *Journal of Management Studies on Disciplinary Training*, vol 2.
- National Council for Teacher Education. (2012). *National curriculum framework for teacher education: Towards preparing professional and humane teacher*, NCTE Document 2009/10, New Delhi.
- Niemi H. (2015). *Teacher professional development in Finland: Towards a more holistic approach*. *Psychology, Society & Education*, 7(3): 279-294.
- Omrani L, Harris, Malek A and Kazemian H. (2017), *A Comparative Study of Teacher and Student-Teacher Professional Development Programs in the Teacher Education System of Iran with the United Kingdom and Japan*, *First International Conference on Comparative Education*, Lorestan University, Khorramabad, Iran .
- Raeisi M. (2017), *A Descriptive-Analytical Study of Internship in Teacher Training Curriculum (Farhangian University) and Its Impact on Teacher Professional Competence*, *First International Conference on Comparative Education*, Lorestan University, Khorramabad, Iran.
- Rezaei A, Nadi M. (2017), *A Comparative Study of Curriculum of Teacher Training Centers in Iran and Japan, England, Germany, France and Canada*, *International Congress on Improving Management and Education System in Iran*, Tehran, Datis Development Conference Center.
- Samieinejad B, Aliasgari M, Musapour N, Haji Hossein nejad GH.(2016), *The Process of Primary Teacher Training at the Level of the Islamic Republic of Iran: Opportunities and Threats*, *Journal of Education* ,32(127).

- Sharafi M, B M. (2016), A Comparative Study of the Impact of In-Service Training on Meeting the Educational Needs and Job Satisfaction of Iranian and German Teachers, *A New Approach in Educational Management* ,7(1).
- Singh L, Shakir M. (2019), Teacher Education: Issues and Concerns in Current Scenario, *International Journal of Research and Analytical Reviews (IJRAR)*, 6(2).
- Theoretical Foundations of Fundamental Transformation, (2011). A teacher education model for the 21st century (TE21), a report by the National Institute of Education, Singapore.
- Vaezi S K, Razzaqhi A. (2015), Study and Prioritization of effective components on the development of innovation and entrepreneurship skills in in-service training systems of employees; Case Study: Civil Registration Organization, *Quarterly Journal of Human Resources Education and Development*, 5(18).
- Vocational Learning Framework for the Teaching Profession, (2016), National Curriculum Framework. NCERT Document, India.
- Yazdanifar L. (2017), A Comparative Study of the Teacher Education System in Iran and Finland, The First International Conference on Comparative Education, Lorestan University, Khorramabad, Iran.