

Examination of the Performance of Social-Cultural Deputy of Municipality in terms of the Indexes of Training Professional Citizens

Sadollah kazemi¹

1. M.A Department of Science Education, Curriculum orientation, College of Humanities, Payam Noor university of Tehran, Tehran, Iran

Article history:

Received date: 2 September 2017

Review date: 21 November 2017

Accepted date: 25 December 2017

Printed on line: 24 February 2018

Keywords:

lawfulness, wisdom, identity, participation, responsibility, ethics, civil behavior, self-esteem, dependency

Abstract

Purpose: The present study was aimed to examine the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of the indexes of training professional citizens. **Methodology:** Research method was descriptive (survey) in terms of data collection method; and in terms of objective, it was practical. The statistical population consisted of all citizens (379962 people) residing in Tehran's region 1. Sample size included 384 individuals selected using a Morgan Table and a cluster random sampling method. Data collection method was a made questionnaire which was designed based on a 5-point Likert scale. Face and content validity of the questionnaire was approved; and its reliability was calculated to be 0.79, using Cronbach's alpha coefficient. In order to analyze data, a single-sample "t" test was used. **Findings:** Obtained results showed that the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality was in a medium level in terms of teaching three components of wisdom, participation, and civil behavior. **Discussion:** The result also indicated that it was in a lower than medium level in terms of teaching six components of lawfulness, identity, responsibility, ethics, self-esteem, and dependency.

Please cite this article as: Kazemi, S. (2018). Examination of the Performance of Social-Cultural Deputy of Municipality in terms of the Indexes of Training Professional Citizens, *Iranian journal of educational Sociology*, 1(8), 33-50.

1. Introduction

Every society's advancement is to a great extent rooted in that society's ability to transfer knowledge, skills, and orientations, which are necessary for playing active and conscious citizen roles (Zakayi, 2002, page 22). Hence, today, in many developed countries, the main concern in education systems is to prepare individuals, from childhood to adolescence, for participation in a civil lifestyle. Therefore, these countries, in their citizen-training programs, focus on engaging individuals in activities related to their life (society). For instance, a recent report from citizen-training studies of the international association of educational evaluation and advancement said that all contemporary societies have this profound concern, i.e. how adolescents and youths prepare themselves for urban life; and they teach them the methods of participating in social affairs (Torney-Purta, 2009; page 17).

Basically, in connection to the concept of citizen and citizenship, there is always the question, "how can we train a citizen in a way that they identify and implement their duties and tasks?" Citizen-training is a controversial concept. In conceptual expression of citizen-training, Govaygli considered three relevant components of citizen knowledge, citizen skills, and citizen attitude as the main elements of the definition of citizenship (Fathi Vajargah and Vahedchukadeh, 2009, page 65).

Citizen-training leads to consolidation and reinforcement of the value system of citizen skills in order to stabilize democracy and provide sustainable cooperation in citizens. This component guarantees the survival and sustenance of social life as well as the advancement of inclusive industrial developing societies. Such a thing, from infancy, socially and ethically results in confidence and responsible behaviors. Another effect of this component is the provision of information and awareness of public matters in the society in local, national, and global dimensions. Such lessons possess virtues and communal civil ethics as well as a search for equity. In fact, teaching citizenship in a society helps all individuals to nationally have a positive citizenship sense in a way that they receive national respect and certain social-political-economic-cultural rights (Mohseni, 2010; page 141).

Learning the parameters of teaching citizenship behavior greatly helps to increase the quality of public life and reinforce social capital in life. Teaching citizenship behaviors is really effective in increasing the quality of the performance of civil organizations. These lessons help to reinforce social ethics and expand social empathy in a society in local, national, and global levels. Teaching citizenship is one city-management duty; in fact, the government and legislating institutes, national and local organizations, civil constitutions and so forth play a considerable role in training citizens through teaching citizen rights and skills of communal life as well as learning about the principles of city management (Sharbatian, 2008, page 154). Hence, the present paper seeks to examine the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of the indexes of training professional citizens.

2. Literature Review

Citizenship is a word which has roots in ancient Greek thought systems; Plato was the first philosopher and political thinker who considered the concept of citizenship in political theories. In his book entitled "republicanism", in which he introduced utopia, he refers to citizens as one of the main pillars of establishing favorable governments. Aristotel also discusses citizenship, and considers citizens as individuals who have roles in governing and obedience. He believes that a good citizen must know how to make orders like a free

man and how to take orders like a free man (Sharifi and Islamieh, 2012; page 110). Today, training citizens, by understanding the challenges of the modern world, is trying to institutionalize the basic principles of citizenship. This training is so important that in all parts of the world, in school books, subjects connected to that have been put forward, becoming increasingly extensive and more profound (Fathi Vajargah, 2006; page 94).

In a general view, we can consider a civil society as a set of citizens who work in the form of institutes and movements in order to control the government (Tajik, 2008; page 31), in which we have the concept of citizenship. In other words, paying attention to things like cooperation, developing communicational institutes, responsibility for the country, providing citizen rights, rule of law, healthy competition, and so forth (Mohammadi, 2008; page 8) requires different organizations (in addition to the education system for students from elementary school to university) to improve individuals' knowledge and skills in a determined way in order to foster effective citizens for city life and playing roles in cities. Hence, harmony with other nations and the basic slogan of "Dialogue of Nations" require every single Iranian to have insight and knowledge of civilizations, cultural heritage, and have respect for their own and other nations' cultural heritage (Fathi Vajargah, 2002, page 181).

Citizenship is the process of living in today's world. Citizenship, with novel emphasis, attempts to provide harmony in social life in a way that the society improves and advances. Citizenship is intertwined with human rights in social life. Citizenship distributes duties and responsibilities to individuals, finally making it possible for them to participate in social activities. Citizenship is like the position of a manmade object whose value and importance are comprehended only by people who are aware of its cultural, social, and information resources. Hence, citizenship must be considered as the process of building and circulating citizenship ethics, a tendency to act for the public good as well as being sensitive to others' emotions, needs, and attitudes. Citizenship implies commitment and duties for individuals (Banisi and Hajisoltani, 2013; page 137).

Citizen dependency and citizenship-training can be considered in the comments of education philosophers. According to Plato, a beautiful and good city is rooted in training. Aristotle's political philosophy also referred to wise leaders, which is rooted in training too. In addition, Bentam emphasizes that democracy is based on wisdom and enlightenment and freedom of thought as well as negotiation and freedom, which are all possible through training. Dewey sees a considerable relation between education and democracy; and he believes that only those democracies that are based on awareness are sustainable. According to Hegel, real training is when we surpass ourselves and become free people (Ghaedi, 2006; page 189).

Citizenship training is one of the basic pillars of social and cultural life in today's societies; hence, this component is one of the main subjects of urban societies in any historical era of humanity. This has been the focus of attention in urban and industrial societies since the nineteenth century, compared to past historical eras, which has led to the emergence and necessity of citizenship skills especially in education and higher education as well as city management. This has forced educational institutes to consolidate and reinforce the value system of citizen skills in order to stabilize democracy and provide local-national cooperation and social-civil identity for citizens through formal and informal planning. Considering the fact that every society, based on its own cultural and value contexts, has certain citizens with special properties, the survival and sustenance of social life and national advancement is guaranteed. There must be extensive preplanned citizen training programs for all individuals; we can start such programs from the country's most formal

training system, i.e. the education system, to Tehran's municipality. Citizenship-training is an investment for the country in all dimensions. In order to make citizens aware of their citizen rights, and if we expect citizens to be committed and responsible citizens, we must teach them to participate in different contexts; an generally, in every society, we must convey values, beliefs, attitudes, and skills together with patterns and methods of participation in communal or civil life in a special manner. Thus, we need citizenship training and teaching citizenship (Gholami, 2011; page 85).

Global education and citizenship training have been emphasized by the fifth international conference of UNESCO in connection to education as inevitable necessities of the modern century (Banisi et al, 2013; page 27). Learning skills, acquiring knowledge and urbanization culture, and enhancing communal and group levels are some of the basic necessities and matters for citizens' survival as well as city managers. Citizens are the main pillars of societies, and endless resources are the essence of urban life and the main element of cities. Therefore, city life is maintained and preserved only when its soul, i.e. its citizens are aware and trained. Learning which is referred to as improving mental representations is not limited to school years. Indeed, a report from the international commission of education for the 21st century (entitled as "learning") considers the treasure embedded in humans' learning process; and it can be based on four dimensions: learning for knowledge, learning for doing, learning for being, and leaning for living together (Mashyekh, 2012; page 3).

Citizenship training needs an ethical-religious reality, which has also been emphasized by religious thinkers; hadiths and stories along with the verses of Quran contain many facets of human rights and citizen rights as well as personal health, in a way that there will be proper relationships between Muslims and religious minorities as well as people in other nations. In the fundamentals of the Islamic Republic of Iran, in addition to the third chapter of fundamentals, which considers human rights (in the sixth clause of the second principle, in clauses 6, 4, 3, 2, 7, 8, 9, 10, 12, 14 of the third principle, and in principles 15, 14, 13, and 12 we can also see implications of citizen rights. Today's social life requires citizens to live in cooperative and harmonious conditions; therefore, there must be special training for citizen rights in order for individuals to become involved in the system of rights and citizen duties as much as possible, due to their being humans and followers; and criteria such as race, religion, and ethnicity must be considered as relevant elements (Ansari, 2012; page 45).

Today, the limitedness of urban resources, unsustainable consumption, polluting the environment, traffic congestions, tax frauds, extra costs of collecting garbage, destruction of public properties and city furniture, cultural diversity without a culture of tolerance, social mergence, feeling a loss of dependence on cities and even neighborhoods, as well as loss of social cooperation for solving city problems lead us to recommend that special attention must be paid to citizenship especially in connection to local governments and urban systems and citizenship (Kalantari and Fallahi Gilan, 2015; page 39).

Developing the country is not possible without training citizens. Costs of unawareness of rights and duties and loss of participation in managing cities lead to underdevelopment and wastage of national capitals. On the other hand, citizens' monitoring for municipality performance leads to requests for citizen rights and participation in managing cities. The strategic objectives of UNESCO for years 2014 to 2021 is to express the position of literacy and basic training, which has been put forward by UNESCO. Some of the objectives are as follows: 1) Developing educational systems for providing all people with lifetime quality learning

opportunities. 2) Empowering learners to become global, creative, and accountable citizens. 3) Forming a framework for future education.

The objective of education in the third millennium is to train professional citizens. The level of success and wealth in individuals, families, social groups, organizations, cities, and today's societies is determined by their level of learning. Tehran's social-cultural deputy of municipality is a municipality deputy that comprises the general offices of citizenship training, women's affairs, planning and developing cities, health, culture, and social-cultural studies. The central subjects of social-cultural planning in Tehran's municipality include: lifestyle with subjects of urban life, citizenship ethics and culture, urban health, identity with subjects of local identity, religious identity, revolution-based identity, and managing cultural differences. The titles of the most important plans and activities in social-cultural fields of Tehran's municipality include: citizenship training, women's affairs, citizens' social health, cultural affairs, social-cultural studies, social services and citizen-athletic-religious participation, and ICT. Generally, citizenship is a social status, based on which individuals are equally treated by law, have mutual rights and duties, and have enhanced public identity in a way that it is possible to actively and consciously take part in activities in order to realize common social goals (strategic plan of citizenship training, 2013; page 13).

According to this plan, "citizen" is referred to as a person who possesses sufficient knowledge and information about the rights and duties of citizens as well as the ability and talent of acquiring skills which make it possible to take part in social activities. A Tehran citizen is an individual who resides or works in Tehran; he or she feels responsible for urban affairs in order to enhance them, considering its specialties such as being a capital city with greatest ethnic diversity, cultural differences, and population density in the country. Finally, citizenship training based on this plan provides the ground for producing capacities for citizens (individuals and groups) in a way that Tehran's citizens, through citizenship training from Tehran's municipality, can use their knowledge and skills for identifying their rights and doing duties as well as actively participating in decision-making in order to take conscious measures in terms of social affairs and urban life, leading to sustainable urban growth (strategic plan of citizenship training, 2013; page 13).

Considering the abovementioned and based on the expression of the importance of citizenship training for citizens, in terms of municipality duties in the field of citizenship training, there is the question, "How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of the indexes of professional citizenship training (lawfulness, wisdom, identity, participation, responsibility, ethics, civil behavior, self-esteem, and dependency)? The present study was conducted in order to answer this question. Theoretical Concepts and Theoretical Research Background. Citizenship is the product of living in today's world. Citizenship, with novel emphases, attempts to provide harmony in social life in order to make it possible to move forward and enhance the society. Citizenship is intertwined with social life (Parker, 2000; page 110).

Citizenship distributes duties and responsibilities among individuals. Finally, it enables people to take part in social activities. Citizenship is like a manmade object whose value and importance is realized only by those who are aware of its cultural, social, and information resources. Hence, citizenship is considered as the process of building and popularizing citizen ethics, tendency to act for the public good as well as being sensitive to the emotions, needs, and attitudes of others. Citizenship implies commitment and/or duties that are appropriate for others (Summers, 2002; page 318).

Citizenship is a set of intentional communications between people who want to avoid a natural state, i.e. a state of life which comprises loneliness, poverty, and unhygienic in an animal condition. Hence,

citizenship is a type of social contract whose main goal is to enhance wealth and security in the society; it also shows how individuals must behave in order to realize this goal (Ghaedi, 2006; page 211).

Citizenship is a twofold essence: social and political. The social essence refers to how citizens must interact with one another, while the political essence refers to the interaction between citizens with the government; both aspects are necessary for a citizen in order to take part in a democratic society (Isfahani, 2010; page 63).

A professional citizen is a citizen who understands their own rights and responsibilities, participate in talks and social associations, expand knowledge, skills, and attitudes, and are able to criticize and evaluate received information (Islamieh, 2009; page 11).

Citizenship training is one of the main pillars of social-cultural life in today's world. Hence, this component is one of the basic subjects of urban societies in every historical era of humanity. This has been the focus of attention in urban and industrial societies since the nineteenth century, compared to past historical eras, which has led to the emergence and necessity of citizenship skills especially in education and higher education as well as city management. This has forced educational institutes to consolidate and reinforce the value system of citizen skills in order to stabilize democracy and provide local-national cooperation and social-civil identity for citizens through formal and informal planning. Considering the fact that every society, based on its own cultural and value contexts, has certain citizens with special properties, the survival and sustenance of social life and national advancement is guaranteed. There must be extensive preplanned citizen training programs for all individuals; we can start such programs from the country's most formal training system, i.e. the education system, to Tehran's municipality. Citizenship-training is an investment for the country in all dimensions. In order to make citizens aware of their citizen rights, and if we expect citizens to be committed and responsible citizens, we must teach them to participate in different contexts; an generally, in every society, we must convey values, beliefs, attitudes, and skills together with patterns and methods of participation in communal or civil life in a special manner. Thus, we need citizenship training and teaching (Khatib Zanjani, 2007; page 10).

Teaching citizenship and citizenship, in fact, comprise acquiring knowledge, skills, and values which are in congruence with the essence and management styles of a democratic and cooperative system; and in effect, it is used as a means of fostering a feeling of dependence in the society and having goals in life. Such a thing, from infancy, leads to socially and ethically confident and responsible behaviors. In fact, these training programs are supposed to foster social-ethical responsibilities, social activity, and literacy, and so forth. Implementing citizenship learning and training programs, in fact, determines a minimum level of structural-political rights in the society. On the other hand, awareness of political-personal-social rights reinforces people. Democracy reinforces participation in political-social-cultural-religious fields. These training programs help individuals to avoid racism, discrimination, and tend towards equity in life and its dimensions. Citizenship training plays a considerable role in extending a civil society, i.e. it develops NGOs and cultural-personal identities. Teaching humanitarian and sexual rights, maximum level of mergence, minimum income, sexual-physical-social-psychological security, active participation in building competencies, political literacy, acquiring skills for making changes such as language, or the ability to equip groups, building skills and training for actions are all implementation elements of citizenship training (Karamali, 2013; page 21). In table 1, a summary of the conducted studies is given:

Table 1. Summary of some conducted studies

| Scholars | Research Title | Obtained Results |
|------------------------------------|---|--|
| Geboers et al (2013) | Examination of the effects stemming from citizenship training | Schools can play an important role in developing citizenship to students; and citizenship training in schools in the field of politics must receive more attention and training than the social field. |
| Kishani Farahani and Salehi (2013) | Offering a model for development of Islamic Citizenship Training | Twelve basic components of Islamic citizenship training include: value, purposefulness, methodology, altruism, religious democracy, meritocracy, investigation, personal independence, efficacy, health, patriotism, and moderation; the component of religious democracy has the greatest mean value. In addition, it has been mentioned that citizenship training has three dimensions: local, national, and international. It has been emphatically recommended that Islamic countries consider citizenship training in contexts such as unity, justice, peace, responsibility, and wisdom in the shadow of Islamic lessons in the education system; in addition, the development of these affairs must be considered in curricula. |
| Peterson & Knowles (2009) | Active Citizenship: A primary study on the level of awareness student-teachers' understanding of active citizen | Data analysis using a Kruskal–Wallis test showed that 47 percent of student-teachers were very aware of the concept of "citizen"; and they strongly believed that being an active citizen is a sensible and stabilized concept while 35 percent of them strongly disagree with this. |
| Law & Ng (2009) | Teaching multifold global citizenship: a description of two cities in China: Hong Kong and Shanghai | Students in the schools of Hong Kong and Shanghai were highly aware of citizen diversity. |
| Li (2009) | Examination of the effect of higher education in China on fostering citizenship characteristics | They must educate and train active citizens; and they must foster students as representatives of the society and reflectors of social thoughts, who actively and strongly participate in political, social, and civil activities. |
| Sharifi and Kalantari (2016) | Examination of information literacy and level of students' awareness of the features of professional citizens in Shahid Beheshti University | The level of students' awareness of the standards of information literacy as well as the features of professional citizens is higher than a medium level. Furthermore, there is not a significant difference between the level of students' awareness of information literacy and the features of professional citizens, in terms of gender and field of study. |
| Ghiasvand(2015) | Teaching citizenship in Tehran's schools; effects and consequences | The most effect of the concept of school mayor on increasing social responsibility and increasing dependency on school environment. However, things such as increasing communal cooperation between students, increasing education, and giving awareness to other students in schools, and also improving the educational status of school mayors were in an unfavorable level. |
| Ganji et al (2014) | Examination of citizen culture with an emphasis on citizenship training by municipality in Aran and Bidgol | Correlation coefficient of 0.17; there was a relationship between municipality trainings programs and the level of loyalty to citizenship culture in the society. In other words, municipality trainings can help significantly increase people's loyalty to citizenship culture. Moreover, from its threefold dimensions, municipality trainings played a stronger role in increasing citizens' level of responsibility (correlation coefficient = 0.33). However, there is not a significant relationship for dimensions such as participation and lawfulness. |
| Odarkhani et al (2013) | Examination of the role of municipality in enhancing citizenship ethics | More than half of the studied population (citizens of region 17) expressed their satisfaction with municipality programs. The level of satisfaction with the training programs of municipality was 66.5 percent, which was the highest among other programs. The level of satisfaction with service styles was 63.3 percent, 56.4 percent with advertisement and information styles, and 59.9 percent with management styles. |

In this study, considering literature review and the background of the relevant research, 9 indexes (lawfulness, wisdom, identity, participation, responsibility, ethics, civil behavior, self-esteem, dependency) were examined; hence, research hypotheses are as follows: How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of the indexes of training professional citizens? 1) How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching lawfulness? 2) How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching wisdom? 3) How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching identity? 4) How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching participation? 5) How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching responsibility? 6) How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching ethics? 7) How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching civil behavior? 8) How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching self-esteem? 9) How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching dependency?

3. Methodology

Considering the fact that the present study was aimed to examine the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of the indexes of training professional citizens, research method was retrospective in terms of incidence time; in terms of results, it was decision-based; in terms of objective, it was practical; in terms of implementation logic, it was comparative-deductive; in terms of implementation time, it was cross-sectional; in terms of the type of data, it was quantitative; in terms of research environment, it was a library research; in terms of data collection method and/or essence, it was survey-descriptive; and in terms of the level of focusing on phenomena, it was profound.

The statistical population consisted of all citizens in Tehran's region 1. Research sample (including 384 individuals) was selected using a Morgan table and a stratified cluster random sampling method.

In this research, in order to collect data, questionnaires were used. Research questionnaire is composed of two parts: 1) part 1 includes general information about respondents such as gender, education, occupational status, age, work background; and 2) the other part includes a made questionnaire for data collection. This questionnaire had 40 closed-answer items, which were scored using a 5-point Likert scale (I totally agree = 5, I agree = 4, I have no idea = 3, I disagree = 2, and I totally disagree = 1), including 9 indexes: lawfulness, wisdom, identity, participation, responsibility, ethics, civil behavior, self-esteem, dependency).

In this paper, in order to determine validity, face and content validity was used. After designing the questionnaires, i.e. after studies were done connected to exploratory concepts and studies, several versions of the questionnaire were distributed to a number of professors, experts, and technicians. They were asked to offer their correctional comments connected to the questionnaire and its items. After comments were received and the questionnaire was corrected, for final modification, the mentioned questionnaire was given to supervisors; and after doing necessary removals and additions, the face and content validity of the questionnaire was approved.

In order to calculate the reliability of the questionnaire, Cronbach's alpha method was used. The devised tool was implemented for 30 individuals from the statistical population, as a trial; and its results were

examined using Cronbach's alpha coefficient, as in tables 2 and 3. The criterion for accepting the questionnaire was to obtain a minimum of Cronbach's alpha (0.70). The obtained values showed that the questionnaire was reliable.

Table 2. Reliability coefficients of research questionnaires

| Component | Cronbach's alpha coefficient |
|-------------------------|------------------------------|
| Lawfulness | 0.71 |
| Wisdom | 0.74 |
| Identity | 0.71 |
| Participation | 0.70 |
| Responsibility | 0.73 |
| Ethics | 0.75 |
| civil behavior | 0.72 |
| Self-esteem | 0.70 |
| Dependency | 0.71 |
| The whole questionnaire | 0.79 |

4. Findings

In order to analyze the data obtained from the questionnaire and based on research questions, to describe status quo, to classify samples in terms of different traits, and to describe research variables, descriptive statistics methods such as frequency, percentage, graph, central tendency (mean, median, mode), and dispersion tendency (standard deviation, variance, magnitude of changes, minimum, maximum, kurtosis coefficient, skewness coefficient) were used. A K-S test was used in order to choose the type of data (parametric or non-parametric). To make inferences about data and to respond to research questions, a single-sample "t" test was used in order to find the difference between sample average and society average in each research variable, using SPSS statistical software.

In this section, and in the following table, demographic data are presented; in addition, research variables in terms of indexes such as central tendency, dispersion indexes, and distribution form indexes, were described.

Table 3. Descriptive indexes of research variables in the statistical sample of the research

| Research variables | Number | Mean | Standard deviation | Variance | Skewness | Kurtosis |
|--------------------|--------|------|--------------------|----------|----------|----------|
| lawfulness | 384 | 2.99 | 0.924 | 0.855 | -0.036 | -0.437 |
| Wisdom | 384 | 3.13 | 0.657 | 0.433 | 0.132 | -0.148 |
| Identity | 384 | 2.89 | 0.763 | 0.583 | 0.213 | 0.029 |
| participation | 384 | 3.23 | 0.728 | 0.531 | 0.351 | -0.354 |
| Responsibility | 384 | 2.64 | 0.790 | 0.624 | 0.494 | 0.487 |
| ethics | 384 | 2.54 | 0.770 | 0.594 | 0.697 | 0.603 |
| civil behavior | 384 | 3.10 | 0.618 | 0.383 | 0.216 | -0.383 |
| Self-esteem | 384 | 2.71 | 0.748 | 0.560 | 0.533 | 0.633 |
| Dependency | 384 | 2.95 | 0.769 | 0.593 | 0.138 | -0.285 |

Table 4. Frequency and frequency percentage of personal and demographic features in the statistical sample of the research

| Personal and social features | Sub-group | Number | Percentage | Mode |
|------------------------------|-----------------|--------|------------|-------|
| Gender | Male | 167 | 43.5 | woman |
| | Female | 184 | 47.9 | |
| | No answer | 33 | 8.6 | |
| | | 123 | 32 | |
| | | 135 | 35.2 | |
| | | 87 | 22.7 | |
| | | 39 | 10.2 | |
| Education | Diploma | 46 | 12 | BA |
| | Associate Level | 91 | 23.7 | |
| | BA | 118 | 30.7 | |
| | MA | 72 | 18.8 | |
| | PhD | 34 | 8.9 | |
| | No answer | 23 | 6 | |
| | | | | |

Research findings in the section of descriptive statistics (respondents' features), given in the above table, showed that the greatest percentage of studied individuals were female (47.9 percent); the highest age range was between 31 and 40 (35.2 percent); the highest educational degree was BA (30.7 percent); Mean and standard deviation of all components are presented. In addition, findings obtained from the previous table showed that kurtosis statistics in all components was between -5 and 5. From this perspective, data distribution was normal; and distribution form was not very flat or long. Moreover, skewness statistics in all dimensions was between -3 and 3, and even between -2 and 2. This means that data distribution was normal, from this perspective; and it can be said that the form of distribution does not have positive or negative skewness. Finally, it can be concluded that the form of data distribution was normal for all components.

Table 5. Results of K-S test

| Component | K-S | Sig |
|----------------|-------|-------|
| Lawfulness | 0.073 | 0.724 |
| wisdom | 0.082 | 0.658 |
| Identity | 0.111 | 0.121 |
| Participation | 0.099 | 0.358 |
| Responsibility | 0.100 | 0.502 |
| Ethics | 0.113 | 0.312 |
| civil behavior | 0.111 | 0.412 |
| Self-esteem | 0.097 | 0.623 |
| Dependency | 0.095 | 0.814 |

As it can be seen in table 6, significance levels in all components are greater than 0.05. Thus, with 65% confidence, it can be said that research data follow features such as normality, and that parametric tests must be used for data analysis. To make inferences about the data, and to respond to research questions, a single-sample "t" test was used in order to find the difference between the mean value of the sample and the mean of the society in each research component, using SPSS statistical software.

Table 6. Results of a single-sample "t" test for examination of research questions

| Research Questions | Mean of sample | Standard Deviation | Mean of society = 3 | | | |
|--------------------|----------------|--------------------|---------------------|--------|-----|-------|
| | | | Average Std.Error | t | df | Sig |
| Question 1 | 2.99 | 0.924 | 0.047 | -0.028 | 383 | 0.018 |
| Question 2 | 3.13 | 0.657 | 0.033 | 4 | 383 | 0.000 |
| Question 3 | 2.89 | 0.763 | 0.038 | -2.65 | 383 | 0.005 |
| Question 4 | 3.23 | 0.723 | 0.037 | 6.35 | 383 | 0.000 |
| Question 5 | 2.64 | 0.790 | 0.040 | -8.92 | 383 | 0.000 |
| Question 6 | 2.54 | 0.770 | 0.039 | -11.51 | 383 | 0.000 |
| Question 7 | 3.10 | 0.618 | 0.031 | 3.17 | 383 | 0.002 |
| Question 8 | 2.71 | 0.747 | 0.038 | -7.53 | 383 | 0.000 |
| Question 9 | 2.95 | 0.769 | 0.039 | -1.23 | 383 | 0.018 |

As it can be seen in table 6, because the value of calculated "t" with a freedom degree of 383 for two-magnitude tests in a 0.05 level is smaller than a critical t (1.96), based on the fact that there is no difference between observed mean value and mean of the society (3), null hypothesis was approved; and it can be concluded that there is not a significant difference between observed mean (sample) and society mean. As a result, with 95% confidence, it can be said that the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of its components is in a medium level, and some are higher than a medium level.

5. Discussion

Research data were obtained from the statistical population of citizens in Tehran's region 1, using collected questionnaires; and to make inferences about data and responses to research questions, a single-sample "t" test was used in order to find the difference between sample mean and society mean. Thus, considering the evidence from the statistical population, according to a theoretical basis and the observed expectation of the research, the following results were obtained.

Question 1: How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching lawfulness? The results related to the examination of the first question, i.e. "how is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching lawfulness?" showed that the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching lawfulness was in a medium level. Lawfulness means maintaining and implementing rules in the society in a just way, leading to observing every individual's rights. Therefore, a society is considered lawful when rules are followed, and when all individuals are equal, according to rules; hence, leaders must be the most law-abiding citizens (Noori, 2004; page 21). The importance of rules in the lives of today's humans who consider themselves as the most civilized people in the history of humanity is completely clear. However, lawfulness in the modern world, on the one hand, relies on rule of law, i.e. the presence of mental and objective contexts for adjusting rules and rules' excellence over all other references in the society; on the other hand, they must be from a bottom-to-top power pyramid, i.e. a democratic system. These two principles which guarantee individuals' lawfulness in the society and nations for the new concept, in fact, express necessary and sufficient conditions for building a culture of lawfulness. In other words, as long as rule of law is not formed through a acculturation mechanism as a belief and also as an important part of lifestyle for individuals in the society, the existence of

a codified rule or a non-codified rule in the society cannot have a positive mechanism; thus, they will not be lawful individuals (Karamali, 2013; pages 77-78).

Education can be the most important facet for issuing rules and giving awareness to the public, in which urban management can play a considerable role. However, the results obtained from the study indicate that the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality was in a medium level in terms of reaching lawfulness; between the obtained result and the results of studies done by Ganji et al (2014) which examined citizenship culture with an emphasis on citizenship trainings from the municipality of Aran and Bidgol, it was indicated that the municipality's trainings have not played any roles in increasing the level of lawfulness in individuals. In a study, Islamieh (2009) found that according to students, academic education has not played any role in building and fostering the features of professional citizens in terms of lawfulness. In a study which determined the components of citizenship training in junior high schools for the purpose of introducing favorable strategies in order to determine the components of citizenship training in Mazandaran's junior high schools, Madanloo (2007) showed that there was not a significant relationship and congruence between the importance of lawfulness, rule of law, and the level of attention to them in school books.

Question 2: How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching wisdom? The results related to the examination of the second question, i.e. "how is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching wisdom?" showed that the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality is in a medium level or above in terms of teaching wisdom. Wisdom is referred to as being aware of historical, social, and cultural subjects in a local, national, and international level, which is considered as a basic prerequisite for citizenship. Basically, important decisions in the society often need citizens who are able to understand extensive information in the society, reports, and studies (Sharifi and Islamieh, 2011; page 135). A favorable society requires knowledge-focused and wise citizens; and basically, wisdom is a factor for developing every city. And with citizens who are aware of all types of information, cities will progress faster. Research results showed that the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching wisdom was in a medium and above-medium level. And there is not a congruence between the obtained result and the results obtained from the study done by Islamieh (2009) (for the purpose of examining the role of academic education in building and fostering the features of professional citizens, according to students), which showed that academic education does not play any role in building and fostering the features of professional citizens in terms of wisdom. The causes of this incongruence include things such as respondents' loss of exact responses to questionnaires as well as giving incompletely exact information connected to the component of wisdom, different years of doing studies, and/or tools used by each of the studies.

Question 3: How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching wisdom? The results related to the examination of the third question of the research, i.e. "how is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching identity?" showed that the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching identity was in a medium level.

Teaching citizenship is based on identity, membership, and new civil-moral-wise commitment for social members in the frame of citizenship, which leads to political-social-cultural-democratic participation, as well as more dependency on the society, finally resulting in society consolidation and social discipline (Tavassoli and Nejati Hosseini, 2014; page 36). Identity is a cognitive phenomenon which contains self-image, navigating individuals' behaviors, motivations, and even emotions. An individual who considers themselves

as a citizen and becomes involved in the identity of a citizen has an interconnected set of awareness, imaginations, and expectations, which adjust and define their relationship with their social environment (Sharifi and Islamieh, 2011; page 22). Via proper planning, urban management can produce global citizens with Islamic-Iranian identity, but the results of the research showed that the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality is in a medium level in terms of teaching identity to citizens; and there was a congruence between the obtained result and the results obtained from a study conducted by Islamieh (2009) (examining the role of academic education in building and fostering the features of professional citizens, according to students) which showed that academic education does not play any role in building and fostering the features of professional citizens in terms of identity in students.

Question 4: How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching participation? The results related to the examination of the third question of the research, i.e. "how is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching participation?" showed that the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching participation was in a medium level or above. Participation means that people can share power and authority, can vote and monitor their fates, and finally can provide advancement opportunities for lower levels of the society (Sharifi and Islamieh, 2011; page 18). Expanding social participation is a facet of citizenship training, which includes engaging adolescents and youths in matters related to life conditions and the concerns of their living environments (learning through participation and volunteering for common-good activities such as giving service to schools, local communities, and bigger communities, by observing ethical rules) (Zakayi, 2002; page 23). According to the findings obtained from the research, the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching participation in a medium or above-medium level; Ghiasvand (2015) examined the effects and consequences of citizenship training in Tehran's schools and found the least effect of the school mayor plan on increasing students' communal participation. Ganji et al (2014) examined citizenship culture with an emphasis on citizenship training in Aran and Bidgol's municipality, and they showed that training programs from the municipality were not related to the level of citizens' participation. Islamieh (2009) examined the role of academic training in building and fostering the features of professional citizens (according to students) and showed that academic education does not play any role in building and fostering the features of professional citizens in terms of participation in students, with no congruence. The causes of this incongruence include things such as loss of exact responses to questionnaire items by respondents, giving incompletely accurate information connected to participation, different years of doing studies, and/or tools used in each of the studies.

Question 5: How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching responsibility? The results related to the examination of the third question of the research, i.e. "how is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching responsibility?" showed that the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching responsibility was in a medium level. Responsibility is a concept which humans are constantly in contact with in their personal and social life. Mergler et al (2007) defined responsibility as the ability to organize thoughts, feelings, and behaviors, together with determination to consider oneself as responsible for choices, as well as the personal and social consequences of choices (page 37). Humans, due to their extensive communication, have numerous responsibilities in different areas. The fields of humans' responsibility can be in contact with God, in contact with family, the society, and nature, together with duties and responsibilities for each mentioned element.

Humans' growth and perfection, whether mental or personal or social, are associated with their responsibility, because individuals' efforts to manage affairs and responsibly respond to surrounding phenomena lead to ethical growth; and they can be very effective in increasing social wellbeing and mental health in individuals (Farhadian, 1999; page 78). To make individuals responsible citizens, there need to be training, and city management can be very helpful in this case, because basically having the spirit of taking responsibilities is one of the characteristics of a good citizen, which has been mentioned in the field civil attitudes (Fathi Vajargah and Diba, 2002; page 34).

There is congruence between the obtained result (i.e. the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching responsibility) and the results obtained from a study done by Chamberlain (2003) who (in the examination of students' comments in England's schools on citizenship training) showed that students were not aware of their social and ethical responsibilities, and that the role of schools in teaching these components was weak. However, there is no congruence between the obtained result and the results obtained from a study done by Ghiasvand (who examined the effects and consequences of teaching citizenship in Tehran's schools) who found that the most effect of the school mayor plan was on increasing the sense of social responsibility. Ganji et al (2014), who examined citizenship culture with an emphasis on citizenship training through the municipality of Aran and Bidgol, showed that citizenship training had the greatest impact on increasing citizens' responsibility. However, there is congruence in the study done by Islamieh (2009) who showed that academic education plays a role in building and fostering the features of professional citizens (according to students). The causes of incongruence include things such as loss of exact responses to the questionnaire by respondents, giving incompletely accurate information connected to responsibility, different years of doing studies, and/or the tools used in each of the studies.

Question 6: How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching ethics?

The results related to the examination of the first question, i.e. "how is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching ethics?" showed that the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching ethics was in a medium level. The ability to behave based on favorable religious and ethical principles is one of the features of a good citizen, which has been mentioned in civil fields too (Fathi Vajargah and Diba, 2002; page 33). Teaching citizenship is strongly correlated with ethics and ethical relationships. This element of citizenship not only monitors political contexts but it also monitors ethical relationships between social members and the conditions of social unity and interconnectedness as well as civil ethics. This educational component is associated with stimuli such as brotherhood, altruism, commitment, and responsibility (Sharbatian, 2008; page 123). In today's world, one of the most efficient mechanisms of urban management for achieving social prosperity and reducing costs is to pay attention and do planning for improving urbanization ethics in citizens. It must be noted that urban management is a tool by which we can have sustainable cultural-social-economic development (Shadi and Shekari, 2013; page 2). According to the conducted studies, the methods used by the municipality have helped to enhance citizenship ethics (Odarkhani et al, 2013; page 77). However, the results obtained from the study showed that the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching ethics is in a medium level. There is congruence between the obtained result and the results of the study done by Islamieh (2009) who found that academic training does not play any role in building and fostering the features of professional citizens in terms of ethics in students. Chamberlain (2003), in his study on students' comments connected with

citizenship training in England's schools indicated that students were not aware the component of ethics and that the role of schools in teaching this component to students was weak.

Question 7: How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching civil behavior? The results related to the examination of the first question, i.e. "how is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching civil behavior?" showed that the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching civil behavior was in a medium level or an above-medium level. Teaching citizenship and citizenship comprise knowledge acquisition, learning skills, and evaluation, which are in congruence with the official essence and styles of a cooperative and democratic system; and they will be used as a means of fostering dependency in the society and having gals for life. Such a thing helps to have confidence and responsible behaviors socially and behaviorally (Sharbatian, 2008; page 123). According to the presented definitions, civil behavior refers to the kind of behavior that aims to help others (Tahoori, 2015; page 3). The behavioral role of citizenship training for citizens in a society includes five dimensions: altruism, chivalry, courtesy, and kindness, and loyalty (Hoveida and Naderi, 2009; pages 105-106). And urban management can teach citizens how to have civil behavior. According to the obtained results, the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching civil behavior was in an above-medium level. There is no congruence between the obtained result and the results obtained from a study done by Islamieh (2009) who (in the examination of the role of academic education in building and fostering the features of professional citizens, according to students) showed that academic education does not play any role in building and fostering the features of professional citizens in terms of civil behavior. The causes of this incongruence include things such as loss of exact responses to the questionnaire by respondents, giving incompletely accurate information connected to civil behavior, different years of doing studies, and/or the tools used in each of the studies.

Question 8: How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching self-esteem? The results related to the examination of the first question, i.e. "how is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching self-esteem?" showed that the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching self-esteem was in a medium level. Self-esteem is the acceptance, value, and respect that a person has for himself/herself. This feeling might be in comparison with others or independent from them. Feeling of value for self-image has a fixed central core which forms a system with a group of surrounding feelings of value. The closer the ideal image to the real self, the more self-esteem in the person, leading to a better personality (Biabangard, 2015; page 136). Studies showed that self-esteem is a theriac for depression, helping to considerably increase confidence and life quality. In addition, self-esteem is known as a protective factor against hazardous behaviors. This means that individuals with positive self-image and feel proud and valuable can confront social and developmental challenges better, effectively leading to self-regulation and independence (Shahmohammadi, 2014; pages 22-23). Therefore, if citizens have self-esteem, there will be a city with no deviations and behavioral problems stemming from lack of self-esteem in citizens. But, according to the result obtained from the research, the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching self-esteem was in a medium level. There is congruence between the obtained result and the results obtained from the study done by Islamieh (2009) (who examined the role of academic training in building and fostering the features of professional citizens, according to students) who showed that academic training does not play any role in building and fostering the features of professional citizens in terms of self-esteem.

Question 9: How is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching dependency? The results related to the examination of the first question, i.e. "how is the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching dependency?" showed that the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching dependency was in a medium level. Dependency refers to a set of feelings and attachments inside a society; and it is through these attachments and feelings that we can define the general features of citizens (Sharifi and Islamieh, 2011; page 32). Based on Dorkim's belief, when there is dependency in the society, there will be a sense of similarity and closeness, and emotional bonds, obsession, and common benefits are intertwined, resulting in an increase in their contacts and communications in the society; and this is the most important tool for good management, especially in third-world countries (Bagheri Banjar and Rahimi, 2012; page 145). The results obtained from the research showed that the performance of social-cultural deputy of municipality in terms of teaching dependency to Tehran's citizens was in a medium level. There was congruence between the obtained result and the results obtained from the study done by Ghiasvand (2015) (who examined the effects and consequences of citizenship training in Tehran's schools) who found the most effect of the school mayor plan on increasing dependency in schools. However, there was congruence between the obtained result and the results obtained from the study done by Islamieh (2009) (who examined the role of academic education in building and fostering the features of professional citizens, according to students) who showed that academic education does not play any role in building and fostering the features of professional citizens. The causes of incongruence include things such as loss of exact responses to the questionnaire by respondents, giving incompletely accurate information connected to dependency, different years of doing studies, and/or the tools used in each of the studies.

It is recommended that citizenship training be implemented by the municipality for all citizens in two styles: "systematic training" and "inclusive training". In the provided training courses, sexual, age, religious, local, and regional matters are considered. The courses are based on religious documents and adapting them to the religious concepts of cognition, anthropological, valorization, and epistemological. By providing attractive plans, social participation is reinforced in different affairs. When providing educational packages of public training for citizens, we must pay attention to the environmental fields of communication (including living place, workplace, communication places, and service places). In order to better train citizens, we must cooperate with governmental and non-governmental institutions. Intra-city citizenship training committees (like urban managers) must be formed in order to have synergy and interaction. In training programs, the age group of learners (children, adolescents, adults) must be considered by planners. The contexts of citizens' communications with city management must be provided. Local halls must be used in order for citizens to communicate more.

References

- Ansari, Esmaeel (2012). "Citizenship rights (Set 1 of articles). Tehran: control deputy, refining and enforcement of rules of the president's legal assistance.
- Bagheri Banjar, Abdolreza; Rahimi, Maria (2012). Examination of the relationship between citizens' social dependency and social-cultural-political cooperation (citizens in regions 3 and 12 of Tehran). *Quarterly of urban demographic studies*. Year 2, Vol. 5, pp 143-170.
- Banisi, Parinaz; Haji Soltani, Mohammad Bagher (2013). Analysis of the contents of the book republicanism by Plato, based on the components of professional citizenship. *The second national gathering of novel management sciences*. Hakim Jorjani non-profit higher education institute, Gorgan.
- Farhadian, Reza (1999). Concepts of education in Quran and Hadiths. Qom: Office of Islamic advertisements.
- Fathi Vajargah, Kurosh, Talaat, Diba (2002). Examination of the features of good citizens for Iran's society and level of adaptation of schools' curricula to this quality. *Research journal of Shahid Behshti University's Literature and Human Sciences Faculty*. Vol. 35, pp 33-62.
- Fathi Vajargah, Kurosh; Vahed Chkadeh, Sakineh (2009). Citizenship training in schools. Tehran: Ayeen Publications.
- Fathi Vajrgah, Kurosh; Vahed Chokadeh, Sakineh (2006). Identification of citizenship training damages in latent curricula: High school education system, according to female teachers of Tehran, and introducing strategies for improving its status. *Quarterly of educational innovations*. Course 5, Vol. 17, pp 93-132.
- Ganji, Mohammed; Niazi, Mohsen; Asri Viri, Asma (2014). An analysis of citizenship culture with an emphasis on citizenship training. *Quarterly of urban sociology studies*. Course 4, Vol. 12, pp 75-100.
- Geboers, Ellen; Geijsel, Femke; Admiraal, Wilfried; ten Dam, Geert (2013). Review of the Effects of Citizenship Education. *Educational Research Review*. Vol 9. PP: 158-173.
- Ghaedi, Yahya (2006). Training future citizens. *Quarterly of educational innovations*. Course 5, Vol. 17, pp 183-213.
- Ghiasvand, Ahmed (2014). Teaching citizenship in Tehran's schools; Effects and consequences. *Quarterly of planning for wellbeing and social development*. Course 6, No. 23, pp 207-239.
- Gholami, MohammedReza (2011). Improving urbanization culture is possible. Role and dimensions of citizenship training in improving urbanization culture. "Media Seminar" book and citizenship training. Set of articles. Tehran: social-cultural deputy of municipality.
- Hoveida, Reza; Naderi; nahid (2009). Examination of the level of organizational citizenship behavior of employees. *Executive management research journal*. Year 9, Vol. 1, pp 103-118.
- Isfahani, Marzieh (2010). "Examination of the role of education in increasing citizens' cooperation in Tehran in the year 2010, according to managers in the municipality". MA thesis. Azad Islamic University (Tehran's Unit).
- Islamieh, Fatemeh (2009). "Examination of the role of academic education in building and fostering the features of professional citizens, according to senior students of Human Science majors (BA level) in Tehran's Azad Islamic University". MA thesis. Azad Islamic University (Garmsar's Unit).
- Kalantari, Abdolhossein; Fallahi Gilan, Rooh Allah (2015). Writings connected to cooperation and citizen rights. Tehran: Center of Tehran's studies and plans.
- Karamali, Nasrin (2013). Study of the level of attention of social sciences curricula in junior high schools to citizenship training. MA thesis. Azad Islamic University (Roodehen Unit).
- Khatib Zanjani, Nazila (2007). Citizenship training is a need in today's society. *Keihan Newspaper*. Vol. 2371. Page 10.
- Kishani Farahani, Ezzat Allah, Salehi, Akbar (2013). Development Model of Islamic Citizenship Education. 2nd Cyprus International Conference on Educational Research (CY-ICER 2013). *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*. Vol 89. PP: 64-68.
- Law, Wing-Wah; Ng, Ho Ming (2009). Globalization and Multileveled Citizenship Education: A Tale of Two Chinese Cities, Hong Kong and Shanghai. *Teachers College Record*. Vol 111. No 4. PP 851-892.
- Li, Jun (2009). Fostering Citizenship in China's Move from Elite to Mass Higher Education: An Analysis of Students' Political Socialization and Civic Participation. *International Journal of Educational Development*. Vol 29. No 4. PP: 382-398.
- Madanloo, Yasaman (2007). Determination of the components of citizenship training in junior high schools in order to propose favorable strategies. PhD thesis. Research and Science University. Management and Economics College.

- Mashayekh, Farideh (2012). Novel attitudes in educational planning. Tehran: School Publications.
- Mergler A. Spencer F. M. and Patton W. A, (2007), Creation, Implementation and Evaluation of a School-Based Program Well-being, Educationa Journl Journal, Vol 2. No 1. PP: 35-51.
- Mohammadi, Majid (2008). Iran's civil society. Tehran: Central publications.
- Mohseni, Rerzaali (2010). Dimensions and analysis of citizen rights. Strategies for teaching citizen rights. Quarterly of political studies. Year 3, Vol. 10, pp 117-144.
- Odarkhani, Mahdieh; Salehi Amiri, Seyed Reza; Poorghasem Mianji, Mahdi (2013). Role of municipality in enhancing citizenship ethics (Municipality of Tehran's region 17). "Quarterly of city management studies". Course 5, Vol. 3. pp 77-87.
- Parker, Gavin (2000). Citizenship, Contingency and Countryside. Rights, Culture, Land and the Environment. London and New York: Routledge.
- Peterson, Andrew & Knowles, Catherine (2009). Active Citizenship: A Preliminary Study into Student Teacher Understandings. Journal of Educational Research. Vol 51. No 1. PP 39-59.
- Sharbatian, Mohammed Hasan (2008). Tamli referred to the concepts of citizenship culture and providing strategies for extending it. Quarterly of research culture, Southern Khorasan's culture. Vol. 8-9, yeras2-3, pp 119-154.
- Sharifi, Asghar; Fatemeh Islamieh, Fatemeh (2012). Examination of the level of students' awareness of citizenship rights (Case Study: Azad Islamic University (Semnan's Unit)). Quarterly of studies on higher education curricula. Year 3, Vol. 6, pp 109-124.
- Summers, Jacqueline Y. (2002). A proposal Model for Anchorage Adult Civic Education. Unpublished Master of Education Thesis.
- Tahoori, Somayyeh (2015). Examination of the relationship between organizational justice and civil behavior in organizational employees. Gathering for novel findings of management sciences, entrepreneurship, and education in Iran. pp 1-17.
- Tajik, Ali (2008). "Civil society". Tehran: Tarh-e-Noe Publications.
- Tavassoli, Gholamabbas; Nejati Hosseini, Mahmud (2004). Social Reality of citizenship in Iran. Magazine of Iran's sociology society. Course 5, Vol. 2, pp 32-60.
- Torney-Purta, J (2009). Civic Education. In: International Encyclopedia of Curriculum. Edited by A. Lewy. Pergamon Press.
- Zakayi, Mohammed Saeed (2002). Citizenship training. Monthly of growth in teaching social sciences. Vol. 19, pp 22-29.